Case 1:08-cv-10420-TPG Document 106 Filed 08/27/14 Page 1 of 3

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10019-6064

TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

LLOYD K GARRISON (1946-1991) RANDOLPH E PAUL (1946-1956) SIMON H RIFKIND (1950-1995) LOUIS S WEISS (1927-1950) JOHN F WHARTON (1927-1977)

WRITER S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

(212) 373-3166

WRITER S DIRECT FACSIMILE

(212) 492-0166

WRITER'S DIRECT E MAIL ADDRESS

aehrlich@paulweiss.com

NO 7 DONGSANHUAN ZHONGLU CHAOYANG DISTRICT BEIJING 1000D PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA TELEPHONE (86-10) 5828 6300

UNIT 3601, OFFICE TOWER A, BEIJING FORTUNE PLAZA

12TH FLOOR, HONG KONG CLUB BUILDING 3A CHATER ROAD CENTRAL HONG KONG TELEPHONE (852) 2846-0300

ALDER CASTLE
10 NOBLE STREET
LONDON EC2V 7JU U K
TELEPHONE (44 20) 7367 1600

FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING 2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME CHIYODA-KU TOKYO 100-0011, JAPAN TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101

TORONTO-DOMINION CENTRE 77 KING STREET WEST SUITE 3100 PO BOX 226 TORONTO, ONTARIO M5K 1J3 TELEPHONE (416) 504-0520

> 2001 K STREET, NW WASHINGTON DC 20006-1047 TELEPHONE (202) 223-7300

500 DELAWARE AVENUE, SUITE 200 POST OFFICE BOX 32 WILMINGTON, DE 19899-0032 TELEPHONE (302) 655-4410

August 27, 2014

*NOT ADMITTED TO THE NEW YORK BAR

BRAD S KARP
PATRICK N KARSNITZ
JOHN C KENNEDY
BRIAN KIM
ALAN W KORNBERG
DANIEL J KRAMER
DAVID LEN AKHODHR
DAVID LEN AKHODHR
DAVID LEN AKHODHR
LANGE
DANIEL J LEFFELL
XIAOYU GREG LIU
JEFFREY D MARELL
MARGOV MASOTTI
DOHN E LANGE
DANIEL J LEFFELL
XIAOYU GREG LIU
JEFFREY D MARGLE
MARGOV MASOTTI
DOHN D W MAYO
ELIZABETH R MCCOLM
MARK F MENDELSOHN
WILLIAM B MICHAEL
TOSTE SHOWERSON
ALEX YOUNG K OH
BRAD R OKUN
KELLE'S D PARKER
MALTER G RICCIARDI
MALTER G RICCIARDI
WALTER G RICCIARDI
WALTER G RICCIARDI
WALTER G RICCIARDI
MALTER G R

By ECF and Hand Delivery

The Honorable Thomas P. Griesa Daniel Patrick Moynihan United States Courthouse Southern District of New York 500 Pearl Street New York, NY 10007

> Allianz Risk Transfer Ag, et al. v. Paramount Pictures Corp., No. 1:08-CV-10420 (TPG)

Dear Judge Griesa:

This firm represents defendant Paramount Pictures Corporation ("Paramount") in the above matter. We write to address the Rule 37 motion plaintiffs filed this past Monday, seeking to preclude the use of certain documents and the testimony of Paramount's damages expert, Robert Wunderlich. We respectfully request that the motion immediately be stricken for violating the Court's prior directive at our May 19, 2014 status conference, as well as Local Civil Rule 37.2. In the alternative, we request a pre-motion conference—as plaintiffs should have done—to discuss the motion and set a reasonable briefing schedule, should that prove necessary.

We believe the motion is replete with gross factual misstatements, and, as our anticipated opposition would show, is entirely without merit. We believe, however, that because plaintiffs' motion violates the Court's prior directive to plaintiffs denying their request to file this exact Rule 37 motion, the motion should be stricken.

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

The Honorable Thomas P. Griesa

2

By way of background, as Your Honor may recall, on May 19, 2014, the parties attended a conference before Your Honor to resolve a scheduling dispute between the parties concerning summary judgment briefing (which motion is now fully briefed and *sub judice*). At the conference, plaintiffs' counsel, Mr. Janowitz, also requested leave to file a Rule 37 motion concerning discovery supposedly withheld by Paramount and the rebuttal expert report of Mr. Wunderlich related thereto. The Court denied plaintiffs' request and informed plaintiffs that they should *not* file any further motions on this topic. Since that time, plaintiffs have never sought permission from the Court to file such a motion. Instead, without permission, plaintiffs filed their motion this past Monday. ¹

In doing so, plaintiffs not only ignored this Court's directive, but also blatantly violated Local Civil Rule 37.2, which requires counsel to request an informal conference with the Court by letter before filing any Rule 37 motion. On this basis alone, plaintiffs' motion should be denied. *E.g., Reed* v. *Delta Airlines, Inc.*, 10 CIV. 1053 JGK, 2011 WL 1085338, at *6-7 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 23, 2011); *Forsythe* v. *Local, 32BJ, SEIU*, 10 CIV. 8557 NRB, 2011 WL 2652395, at *5 (S.D.N.Y. June 23, 2011).

For all of the above reasons, we believe plaintiffs' Rule 37 motion is improper, and thus respectfully request that the motion immediately be stricken or denied. Or, at a minimum, we respectfully request a conference as soon as possible to discuss the pending motion and briefing schedule—as plaintiffs should have done—since the potential deadline for opposing plaintiffs' improper motion falls immediately after Labor Day weekend, on September 2nd. We are available to meet at the Court's convenience.

Respectfully

Andrew J. Ehrlich
Andrew J. Ehrlich

Enclosure

cc: All counsel of record (by ECF and email)

At plaintiffs' request, enclosed please find a letter that we received from them today.



New York | Los Angeles

7 Times Square, New York, NY 10036-6569 Tel: 212-421-4100 Fax: 212-326-0806

www.pryorcashman.com

Bryan T. Mohler Attorney at Law

Direct Tel: (212) 326-0466 Direct Fax: (212) 798-6907 bmohler@pryorcashman.com

August 27, 2014

BY EMAIL

Andrew J. Ehrlich, Esq. Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison LLP 1285 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10019-6064

Re:

Allianz Risk Transfer AG, et al. v. Paramount Pictures Corp.,

No. 1:08-CV-10420 (TPG)

Dear Andrew:

We are in receipt of your letter of last evening, concerning Plaintiffs' recently-filed Fed. R. Civ. P. 37 and Fed. R. Evid. 702 motion.

While we intend to respond to your letter as soon as possible today, Jim Janowitz is out of the office this week on vacation, with limited availability. Therefore, we will not be able to respond to your letter by Noon. When your submit your letter to the Court at Noon, please include a copy of this letter.

Very truly yours,

Bryan T. Mohler

cc: Leslie G. Fagen
Allan J. Arffa
Richard B. Kendall
Phil M. Kelly
Patrick J. Somers
James A. Janowitz
William L. Charron

(all via email attachment)